Attitudes towards Gender among Gender Studies Students from Public Sector Universities in Pakistan

Hasnat Ahmad¹, Ra’ana Malik²

¹Ph.D. Scholar, Department of Gender Studies, University of The Punjab, Lahore, Pakistan. Email: engr.hasnat@gmail.com
²Department of Gender Studies, University of the Punjab Lahore, Pakistan. Email: raana.malik@yahoo.com

ARTICLE INFO

Article History:
Received: January 27, 2023
Revised: March 22, 2023
Accepted: March 23, 2023
Available Online: March 24, 2023

Keywords:
Attitude towards Gender
Women and Gender Studies
Coursework
Public Sector Universities

Funding:
The researcher received funding from the Higher Education Commission (HEC) of Pakistan.

ABSTRACT

The study of gender as a subject in universities was a significant addition to Pakistani Higher Education. It was envisioned by Women’s Development Department to inspire others to take action in favor of equality and social change. Scholarship on women’s literature and gender suggested that students taking Women and Gender Studies courses developed awareness and the ability to critically analyze patriarchal norms. But the gender role attitude of students from WGS courses had been less researched in Pakistan. So, the present research was designed to explore the gender role attitudes of final year BS Honors (BSH) taking WGS courses. In this qualitative study, purposive sampling was used for participant recruitment to explore attitude towards gender among students from selected coeducation public sector universities of Punjab, Pakistan. A standard tool Traditional and Antitraditional Gender Role Attitude Scale (TAGRAS) served as a screening tool for the selection of participants from the University of the Punjab, Lahore and Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan. On the basis of TAGRAS scores, twenty-one participants were recruited for qualitative interviewing. After transcription and coding, the thematic analysis presented that WGS courses helped to understand the gender issues. Some participants carried on with the traditional understanding while others developed resistance against the prevalent ideology. Some students showed commitment to apply the ideas in coming life while others did not feel courage to apply it in their families. The participants having an anti-traditional attitude towards gender roles did gender differences in the immediate family members but felt difficulty to perform in the extended family or in society. The study had implications for curriculum developers, policymakers, and course instructors.

© 2023 The Authors, Published by iRASD. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution Non-Commercial License

Corresponding Author’s Email: engr.hasnat@gmail.com

1. Introduction

Individuals’ gender beliefs are important because they affect the prevalent gender ideology that shapes a society’s efforts to maintain or reduce gender inequalities in society, which are more severe especially in developing countries (Dhar, Jain, & Jayachandran, 2019). The gender inequalities lead to fewer educational opportunities for women and girls, lesser autonomy over marriage compared to their male counterparts, women have lower control over birth rate, fertility, and labor force participation (Duflo, 2012; Jayachandran, 2015). With the aim to minimize the gender inequalities, the academic discipline of women studies was introduced in United States education institutions resulting from long decade of equal rights activism regarded as second-wave feminism triggered by Betty Friedan’s foundational text ‘The Feminine Mystique’ (Kirkup & Whitelegg, 2013; Rosser, 2013; Stake, 2006). Now the objectives of feminist-inspired teaching have changed from origin of Women Studies in the 1960s, by starting from a women-oriented scholarship, to presently offering a variety of themes that strive to challenge social authority and institutions of social dominance (Boxer, 2002).
Based on the wider feminist movements' efforts to raise awareness in the 1960s and 1970s, this commitment to change can be seen in most gender studies courses (Malkin & Stake, 2004). WGS courses continue to put a strong emphasis on the creation, encouragement, and teaching of new scholarship on men, women, and gender believing education is the key to the struggle for gender equality (Malkin & Stake, 2004; Rosser, 2013). In spirit, by informing university (college) students on the culture of gender, it works to transform individual consciousness to bring change in the conventional society (Sevelius & Stake, 2003). Arguably, one important aspect of this effort is to transform individual’s attitude towards gender.

The attitudes toward the social roles for men and women in society are known as gender role attitudes and there has been a shift in gender role attitudes across societies and countries (Charles & Cech, 2010; Constantin & Voicu, 2015; Knudsen & Waerness, 2001). The advancement of education, particularly higher education, is one of the key determinants of the economic, social, political, and cultural development of the nations. Higher education experiences are seen to have a positive influence on a person’s tolerance and acceptance of diversity (Brown, Clarke, Gortmaker, & Robinson-Kellig, 2004). Stake and Malkin (2003) also argued a positive role of WGS courses to help students in developing egalitarian gender role attitudes. It might help in reducing the gender gaps and reflect in indicators of a country’s gender parity reports.

While assessing the gender index at international level, Global Gender Gap released by World Economic Forum (2022), on a scale of 1 to 156, Pakistan is positioned at 145. The report presents some progress on gender political empowerment but the overall ranking of the country has been found in the bottom of the countries since 2006. At national level, Punjab Commission on the Status of Women (PCSW, 2021) report highlights the gender gaps that still persist in the largest province of Punjab. Arguably, the gender gap remains wider for inequalities between men and women. The report suggests a strong division of Pakistani society in terms of gender stereotypical beliefs. The lowest positions on the indicators draws attention to first study of those people having knowledge of gender equality.

Smith (2018) conducted a mixed method study with the students of non-elective gender coursework and found whether or not they changed their attitudes, pupils appeared to be as likely to do so in classes with and without a gender component. Yet, despite the fact that the rates of change were similar across groups, students studying in the gender component courses scored higher in Pre- and Post-scale test than those with non-gender component courses. Similarly, Smirles et al. (2020) studied Japanese college women for awareness about gender stereotypes and roles. Comparisons were also drawn for courses with and without women leadership and found that these courses were helpful in making progress for their consciousness raising.

Farré and Vella (2013) investigated the shift in gender role attitudes and that how it affected women's participation in the labor force. The results of the study indicated that young male and female supported the role of females in labor market nowadays because in the previous years female were not supported for the market job. The results explained that men had more traditional gender roles than their counterparts. Further results discussed that a mother who participated in labor market developed egalitarian attitudes in the gender role attitudes of their young children. The results also depicted that family system also contributed in the attitudes transformation of individual and that the individuals living in extended families had more traditional gender attitudes towards the gender role. Moreover, the results discussed that cultural transmission added to the heterogeneity in the labor supply of women.

The literature on WGS coursework and its outcomes, Stake and Hoffmann (2001) conducted an experimental study to compare the effects of classes in women's studies (WS) and non-women studies (NWS) on the students’ outcomes. On 32 college campuses, evaluating 548 WS and 241 NWS students who took part in the study, WS students showed greater gains than students with NWS in terms of developing egalitarian attitudes towards women and other marginalized groups, greater knowledge on sexism as well as other forms of discrimination, intention to engage in social activism and activism for social causes, while applying repeated (pretest, posttest, and follow-up) and changing subjects. Although this study showed that the
students with WS classes experienced more change than NWS students, yet the subjective views about the attitudes of students from traditional societies remained unexplored.

Likewise, considering the same variables, Stake and Malkin (2003) study showed that students’ development of more egalitarian gender role attitudes was successfully assisted by women’s and gender studies (WGS) classes. Craig (2004) focused their work on the mechanisms by which these changes occurred. The participants were WGS students (n = 328) from 23 classes across four college campuses. The findings showed that student predicted the development of alliances with teachers and cohesion with classmates. In addition, cohesion and alliance were associated with changes towards more egalitarian attitudes (Malkin & Stake, 2004). But they did an experimental study and did not consider the individual differences which the scholars also mentioned in the discussion that students might have responded in this way.

In addition, Hoke-Sinex (2006) conducted a study with students of education and gender discipline. Three different sections of the same undergraduate course’s gender studies students (n=118) completed a variety of questionnaires relevant to these topics as pre- and post-course assessments. In the control group, forty-eight students completed the survey. According to pre-course assessments, female students’ self-reports of low acceptance of disparities, high awareness of injustices, high exploration of the feminist perspective, and high consolidation of feminist perspective were all significantly correlated with prior sexism experience. Students in gender studies were less receptive of gender injustices than students in education, according to post-course surveys. Students majoring in gender studies were likewise more likely to change their gender identities than students majoring in education. This was a quantitative study done assuming a possible change in gender identity among the students of gender studies as elective courses.

Stake, Sevelius, and Hanly (2008) investigated student receptivity to women’s and gender studies (WGS) in a large sample of students (519 women and 143 men) enrolled in one of 48 WGS courses at one of six universities in a significant Midwestern urban area. The findings showed that students generally felt much more empowered by their classes than distressed or furious, formed positive relationships with their WGS lecturers and other students, and altered their attitudes and behaviors during their classes towards a higher awareness of sexism. Men were not more upset or frustrated with their classes than women were, despite the fact that women reported more positive classroom relationships and stronger feelings of empowerment from their WGS experience. When ceiling effects were reduced, students who started their classes with more feminism-oriented attitudes displayed more change towards awareness of sexism and flexibility in gender roles than those who started with less feminism-oriented attitudes. By the end of the class, these students reported feeling more empowered than those who started with less feminist-oriented attitudes. These adjustments were made possible by the growth of supportive classroom connections. However, the study was conducted with a larger sample neglecting the individual experiences and subjective viewpoints of the respondents about the changing attitudes toward gender. Furthermore, as the study indicated, Asian Americans were less open to gender diversity in a relatively modern society of a developed country, so it is important to study the dynamics in an underdeveloped country with a traditional society.

Similarly, Spoon and Lehmliller (2014) conducted an experiment on psychology students studying a women’s and gender studies course. The participants were enrolled in one of two similar courses but with different title of course (Psychology of Women vs Psychology of Gender) and different gender of course instructor. The participants considered that a course with woman-titled was only limited to women in comparison with a similar course as gender-title. They showed greater interest to take the course with gender-title. Gender of instructor had no effects on the variables. Moreover, regardless of title of course, female participants’ attitudes were more positive than that of male participants. This was an experimental study done with the students of psychology and not with the gender studies course. The students of gender studies courses were not studied.

Frieze et al. (2003) university students from Ljubljana, Slovenia, Osijek, Croatia, and Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, in the United States, were researched to determine the factors that influenced gender-role attitudes. Between 1991 and 2000, surveys with questions from the Attitudes towards Women Scale and the Neosexism Measure were given to 1,544 American students, 912 Slovene students, and 996 Croatian students. As expected, men had less
egalitarian or more sexist ideas about what roles women and men should play, and those who attended religious services more frequently had more sexist attitudes. Slovenian women’s attitudes did not alter over time, but Slovene men’s attitudes did shift over time, becoming more traditional. In addition to examining university students and with the students of gender studies, researchers had also studied dynamics of gender role attitudes in other dimensions. As Walter (2018) explained that several studies support the idea that gender role attitudes are affected by the context in a country (Cha & Thébaud, 2009; McDaniel, 2008), however, the association between cultural context and gender role attitudes was probably reciprocal (Grunow, Begall, & Buchler, 2018).

Moreover, Neilson and Stanfors (2014) investigated how family policies affected the family and divided up the work. The distribution of labour within a family was probably also linked to gender role attitudes, even if they only looked for an influence on actual conduct and did not investigate the influence on attitudes. Moreover, Paxton and Kunovich (2003) research demonstrates a link between gender role attitudes in a nation and the percentage of women in parliaments. Hence, numerous research had shed light on how gender role attitudes were influenced by personal traits and the social environment, as well as the explanations for changes in attitudes at the individual and regional levels. There were also several studies that examined how attitudes on gender roles evolved over time or between cultures and shed light on the factors that influenced these belief. The research studies noted above provided supporting evidence to summarize that gender role attitudes were significant to study in different dimensions. But most of the researchers (Hoke-Sinex, 2006; Jones & Jacklin, 1988; Spoor & Lehmiller, 2014; Stake & Hoffmann, 2001; Stake & Malkin, 2003) conducted studies by using experimental designs or quantitative comparisons (Frieze et al., 2003; Stake et al., 2008; Thomsen, Basu, & Reinitz, 1995). Subjective experiences of students in gender studies coursework were neglected or least emphasized. In addition, the countries where researches had been conducted had more modern society as compared to Pakistan where it was more traditional.

In Pakistani context, there was a dearth of literature on attitudes towards gender in context with perceived influence of gender studies coursework. Along with this, working of gender studies departments in the country needed to be studied to see its effectiveness in terms of its capability of transforming attitude towards gender roles. Therefore, it became important to explore the practicality in reducing gender inequality. Present research study was an attempt to fill this knowledge gap in terms of Pakistani context that how students from different socio-economic and cultural backgrounds transformed attitude towards gender in public sector coeducation universities in Pakistan with the help of gender as a core subject.

Gender research in the past had mostly centered on sex and gender roles. In response to this research, West, Zimmerman, and later West and Zimmerman (1987) expanded upon and changed how people talked about gender by asserting that gender was “done” through interactions rather than as a particular role or characteristic of people. We "do" (and re-do, re-make, and re-constitute) gender every day, according to West and Zimmerman, who had developed an explicitly ethnomethodological (and hence, especially sociological) concept of gender. Doing gender was built on interactions, thus we did it in front of other people (be that in the physical or electronic presence of others). Gender was less about what or who we were and more about how we went about doing what we did. Gender was created through and inside encounters, therefore how we created gender was evaluated by others according to whether or not we have succeeded in achieving our goals. Yet most of the time, our goal is to replicate, reinforce, or reinvent traditional gender notions. Gender itself is an “activity of managing situated conduct in light of normative conceptions of attitudes and activities appropriate for one’s sex category” (West & Zimmerman, 1987). West and Zimmerman (1987) posited that “doing” gender was a part of a routine accomplishment in everyday life.

2. Methodology
The departments offering gender studies courses in public sector universities in Pakistan were purposefully were selected for data collection. There were 13 public sector and 2 private sector institutes offering W/GS courses in Pakistan. Among these, there were 2 single sex (female institutes) that were excluded. Using the exclusion criteria, private sector institutes were also excluded because of the greater class differences that might be affecting the results.
Therefore, the participants were planned to recruit from the coeducation public sector universities. Among the selected universities, this paper discussed the data of two universities, one taken from center and the other from south Punjab.

Klocke and Lamberty (2016) presented Traditional and Antitraditional Gender Role Attitude Scale (TAGRAS). It was adapted as screening tool to get the participants for interviewing. From BS Gender courses, 30 students from the University of the Punjab, 32 from BZU Multan filled the screening questionnaire. The participant scores were helpful in participant recruitment for an open-ended interview. The participants were then recruited on the basis of their scores on the tool. Students on the extreme ends (with lowest, middle and highest) scores were further probed. TAGRS scores were used to identify 21 students for this study, and interviews were conducted with those participants who were accessible at venues of the research participants (University offices, canteen, office of colleagues).

The data collected on screening tool TAGRS was analyzed according to the instructions on the manual. The final TAGRAS scores divided the respondents into traditional, egalitarian and anti-traditional attitude towards gender. It helped to identify the potential participants for interviews. The qualitative data transcription, coding and theme emergence were conducted in cyclic process till the saturation point.

3. Results
Total 21 participants were selected for interview whose age ranged from 21 to 25. Ten participants were selected from Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, in which four participants were living in urban and six participants were living in rural areas. Eleven participants were selected form University of the Punjab, Lahore in which five participants were living in urban and five participants were living in urban areas (Table 1).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>background</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Code</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>background</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Z</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>U</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>J</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>K</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>T</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Multan</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>Lahore</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: F, Female; M, Male.

Four thematic themes (perception of Gender Studies’ students, attitudes of students, maintenance of prevalent ideology, resistance to prevalent gender ideology) were emerged from the data. The details are given below.

3.1. Perception of Gender Studies’ Students
Gender is a vast term, and it includes all types of gender i.e., male, female, children, transgender, gays, and lesbians. Globally, all these terms fall under the umbrella of Gender while every society has different acceptance level for all types. In Pakistan, socially accepted genders are only male, female and transgender. The students studying this subject also have different perceptions about the concept of gender. After gaining knowledge the students make perceptions according to their mindsets and understanding level, especially gender as an education. The term ‘gender’ is misunderstood sometimes. Majority of students take it as a study of women, which helps to understand their rights. One of the respondents said,

“The study of gender is based on advocating the rights of women in society, but I can’t do this in society. People won’t like it” (T, F, M, 23). Students of selected universities consider gender which some time supports the basic rights and relationships of both male and female. As, one of the respondents said that “In my opinion, this discipline is about both male, female, their rights and relationships (F, M, L, 24).
3.2. **Attitudes of Students**

This research study explores the gender attitudes of students studying in universities. These attitudes are further discussed in three forms i.e. traditional, anti-traditional and egalitarian. These attitudes are developed by the students while learning and observing the gender studies field. Participants frequently express how empowering and life-changing gender studies classes are, saying that everyone should take them." Further, most of the participants convey that they have developed egalitarian attitude towards gender as both men and women have equal rights and responsibilities towards each other. One of the respondents replied,

"Women and men should have equal opportunities to enjoy all human rights i.e., freedom of choice, freedom of movement, and decision making etc." (H, F, 25). However, another participant responded that, “Men have control over all resources as they directly involve in productive role” (I, Female Student, Rural, 23).

Whereas, the participants from the university students developed anti-traditional attitudes after studying the subject of gender. The participants consider women as more marginalized segment of the society and that they need more attention to develop and enhance their course of life. One participant discussed that

"Women are more marginalized than men and they should integrate in mainstreaming by giving all rights equal to men“ (N, M, 22). Some male participants had the opinion that female should drive the car and participate in family decision making regarding utilization of income, and their property. M, M, L, (21) told that “I developed my mind after reading gender studies as a subject; women should take part in decision making, especially in the decision of utilization of their property and income”

3.3. **Maintenance of Prevalent Ideology**

The subject of Gender studies taught in public institution gets different exposure and experience for students during their stay in these institutions. Family background, socialization, prior knowledge, teacher’s knowledge, interaction with teachers and classmates are some major factors in shaping the perception of students towards gender. The perception of students is not different based on institute as Gender Studies. But with the passage of time and interaction with other people and situations, students’ perception has been changed. A participant (Y, Male, Rural, 23), told that,

"Males are for breadwinning role as they are strong by nature, and I also prefer to do productive work only. Our religion also allows us to beat the women if she disobeys. How can we contradict our religion” Decision making role should be performed by participation of both as it is very difficult to bring out change in this patriarchal society”

3.4. **Resistance to Prevalent Gender Ideology**

WGS courses also enable students to form resistance against the prevalent gender ideology of the society. It gives knowledge and courage to broaden the understanding in creating resilience among them.

"Now I come to know that the things I learnt in my early ages were socially constructed and are not fixed, I will definitely apply them in my coming life. Starting from my own wife and children, I am committed to apply them for my extended family members“ (M, Urban, 22).

4. **Discussion**

While exploring the attitude towards gender among the students taking full time gender courses in the public sector universities in the Punjab, numerous key ideas emerged about their attitude towards gender. The male students showed willingness to apply these ideas in the future. Despite the fact that the family setting remained traditional to them. "Women and men should have equal opportunities to enjoy all human rights i.e., freedom of choice, freedom of movement, and decision making etc.” (H, Female Student, Urban, 25). However, there was a commitment to bring change in the prevalent gender ideology. The findings were in line with Schmitz and Kazayak (2017) who concluded that feminist pedagogy positively developed understanding of gender inequalities.
The study revealed that even after taking gender courses, students showed a range of attitude towards gender roles. In addition to the egalitarian attitude, both traditional and anti-traditional attitude towards gender roles showed that the outcomes were different after studying the same courses. One of the respondents said, “I have learned from my all experiences that traditional Doing Gender concept has been changed and I also prefer equality of women and men in all spheres of life” (H, Female Student, Urban, 25). The findings were consistent with the scholars who argued that not all students had shown positive change (Stake & Hoffmann, 2001).

Another important concept was related to the difficulties of expressing the new ideas of gender equality in the society. There were still some problems at the societal level that hindered the participants to practice the ideas of gender equality. So, the participants found it difficult to do it in the society as they faced reaction of doing gender differently. “The study of gender is based on advocating the rights of women in society, but I can do this in society. People won’t like it” (T, F, 23). This was in line with the findings of Bulbeck (2001) who said that despite changes in attitudes, even after WS courses, students still faced challenges in expressing constraints of patriarchy.

The participants considered WGS department as safe gendered spaces. They were easily able to discuss and do gender as they wanted it to do. The female did not report the unsafety issues in the class and felt comfortable with their male fellows. The findings were inconsistent with the work of Guckenheimer and Schmidt (2013) who concluded that in their case, feminist classrooms were inherently not “safe spaces.”

The study also accounted for the facts how men tried to protect and reinforce the male privilege in society. Some of male participants, however, were more traditional and supported for “masculinity” and continuation of patriarchal norms. “Males are for breadwinning role as they are strong by nature, and I also prefer to do productive work only”. They also argued through religious aspect and debated for using religion as means of control over women. “Our religion also allows us to beat the women if she disobeys. How can we contradict our religion?”. The findings were supported with the conclusions drawn by Pleasants (2011) that suggested men’s resistance was often unconscious, enacted despite their stated openness and interest in learning feminism. It is men who were ultimately losing control over women, so it might be opposed unconsciously. This work documented the appeals and discourses showing how Adana et al. (2011) also maintained that more than fifty percent of male participants approved honor killing or argued for supporting the physical violence on females under certain conditions.

5. Conclusion

This study demonstrates that in the traditional societies of developing countries like Pakistan, WGS courses are striving to incorporate the idea of equality especially in public sector higher education institutes. Though the students’ attitudes are not that much egalitarian as it should be after taking the WGS courses, yet the presence of egalitarian and anti-traditional attitude towards gender shows its contribution to achieve the desired goals. Female participants are more egalitarian and committed to practice than the male participants. At the same time, the societal resistance remains a challenge to both of them. One of the major challenges is the strong prevalence of societal norms and the fear of reaction of society.

References


Spoor, J. R., & Lehmiller, J. J. (2014). The impact of course title and instructor gender on student perceptions and interest in a women's and gender studies course. *PloS one, 9*(9), e106286. doi:https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0106286


